



Materials for
PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW (252S)

VOLUME 2
(Topics 7 - 11)

January 1997

Professor Craig Scott
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

These Materials are sold at cost and
are not to be considered as published.

They are solely for the educational
use of students at the University of Toronto
or at other educational institutions
to whom the Materials
may also be sold at cost.

Storage

JX
68
S32
1997
v.2
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

FEB 3 1996

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Materials for
PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW (252S)

VOLUME 2
(Topics 7 - 11)

January 1997

Professor Craig Scott
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

These Materials are sold at cost and
are not to be considered as published.
They are solely for the educational
use of students at the University of Toronto
or at other educational institutions
to whom the Materials
may also be sold at cost.



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/materialsforpubl02scot>

TABLE OF CONTENTS: Volume 2

- NOTE 1:** The course will be taught using these Materials as well as Ian Brownlie, eds., Basic Documents in International Law, 4th ed. (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995). A course reading list will indicate the provisions of instruments contained in Brownlie to be read in tandem with the readings contained in this volume and subsequent volumes.
- NOTE 2:** "K:#" refers to an extract or note from Kindred et al., International Law: Chiefly as Interpreted and Applied in Canada, 3rd ed. (1987)
- "H:#" refers to an extract or note from Harris, Cases and Materials on International Law, 4th ed. (London: Sweet and Maxwell. 1991)
- "HPSS:#" refers to an extract or note from Henkin, Pugh, Schachter and Smit, International Law: Cases and Materials, 2nd ed. (St. Paul, Minn.: West Publishing, 1987)

Topic 7: HUMAN RIGHTS AND TREATY OBLIGATIONS (I)

From Responsibility for Harm to Aliens to Human Rights

Hackworth, <u>Digest of International Law</u>	1
"International Minimum Standard or National Treatment" @ K:565	1
"Before the U.N. Charter" @ K:635+	2
"Universal Declaration of Human Rights" @ K:644	2
Humphrey, "Impact and juridical character of the Declaration"	9
Excerpts from the <u>Vienna Declaration of Human Rights and Programme of Action</u> (1993)	10
Theodor Meron, Excerpts on <u>erga omnes</u> norms	12

Traditional Law on State Responsibility for Mistreatment of Foreign Nationals

Direct Responsibility and the International Standard

<u>Roberts Claim</u> (US v Mexico) @ H:412	13
--	----

Direct Responsibility, Attribution and the Duty to Account

<u>Quintanilla Claim</u> (Mexico v US) @ K:567	14
--	----

Indirect Responsibility, Positive Obligations and the Acts of Private Citizens

<u>Noyes Claim</u> (US v Panama) @ K:569	15
--	----

Responsibility for Ultra Vires Acts

<u>Youmans Claim</u> (US v Mexico) @ K:561	16
--	----

The Confluence of Traditional Principles of State Responsibility for Aliens and Modern International Human Rights Obligations

Buergenthal, "Introductory Note"	18
--	----

<u>Velasquez Rodriguez v. Honduras</u> (Inter-American Court on Human Rights)	19
---	----

Positive Obligations to Protect: Indirect Responsibility for Acts of Foreign States in Modern International Human Rights Law

<u>Khan v. Canada</u> (United Nations Committee on Torture)	31
---	----

<u>Faustina Annan v. Minister of Citizenship and Immigration of Canada</u> (Federal Court, Trial Division)	38
--	----

Topic 8:

HUMAN RIGHTS AND TREATY OBLIGATIONS (II)

General Overview of the Place of Reservations in Treaty Law

Martin Dixon, "Reservations" in <u>Textbook on International Law</u>	40
--	----

Department of Foreign Affairs (Canada), "Treaties -- Means of Expressing Consent to be Bound by Treaty" and "Treaties -- Reservations and Declarations of Interpretation"	41
"Protection of the Canadian Constitutional Position" @ K:133	42
"Importance of Reservations" @ HPSS:427	43
"Exclusion of Reservations" @ HPSS:422	44

The Law on Reservations Emerging from the Genocide Convention Context and the Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties

<u>Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide</u>	45
"Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide -- Reservations and Declarations"	47
<u>Reservations to the Genocide Convention Case (ICJ) @ HPSS: 415</u>	51
Notes on <u>Reservations Case</u> @ HPSS: 420, 430	54
Bowett, "Reservations to Non-Restricted Multilateral Treaties" @ HPSS: 423	55
<u>Advisory Opinion on Restrictions to the Death Penalty (Inter-American Court on Human Rights)</u>	58

The Debate Over Whether International Human Rights Treaties Constitute a Special Field of Application of the Law on Reservations

Philip Alston, "Establishing Accountability: Some Current Challenges in Relation to Human Rights Monitoring"	60
"Text of U.S. Reservations, Understandings and Declarations"(to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights -- the ICCPR)	63
Notes on Responses to U.S. ICCPR Reservations in Steiner and Alston, <u>International Human Rights in Context: Law, Politics, Morals</u>	64

ICCPR Human Rights Committee, General Comment no. 24 (52) (1994) on issues relating to reservations	65
--	----

Observations on General Comment no. 24 by the United Kingdom and the United States	70
---	----

**The Normative Force of Interpretations of the ICCPR under the Optional Protocol
Communications Procedure For States Not Party to the Optional Protocol**

<u>Toonen v Australia</u>	76A
-------------------------------------	-----

**Topic 9:
HUMAN RIGHTS AND TREATY OBLIGATIONS (III)**

Competing Conceptions of Treaty Interpretation

Extracts from Gerald Fitzmaurice, "The Law and Procedure of the International Court of Justice: Treaty Interpretation and Certain Other Treaty Points" @ K:153	77
--	----

Myres McDougal, "The International Law Commission's Draft Articles Upon Interpretation: Textuality <i>Redivivus</i> "	78
--	----

Gerald Fitzmaurice, " <i>Vae Victis</i> or Woe to the Negotiators! Your Treaty or Our 'Interpretation' of It?"	83
---	----

Rosalyn Higgins, "Alternative Perceptions of International Law" in "The Identity of International Law"	88
---	----

Different Premises for Treaty Interpretation in the Field of Human Rights

Thomas Buergenthal, "Advisory Practice of the Inter-American Court" @ HPSS: 415	90
--	----

<u>Johnston v. Ireland</u> (European Commission of Human Rights)	93
--	----

<u>Johnston v. Ireland</u> (European Court of Human Rights)	99
---	----

Taking Premises Seriously: Interpreting Women's Human Rights

Hilary Charlesworth, Christine Chinkin and Shelley Wright, "III. The Masculine World of International Law" in "Feminist Approaches to International Law"	103
--	-----

Hilary Charlesworth, "The Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Violence Against Women"	106
Excerpts from the <u>Vienna Declaration of Human Rights and Programme of Action</u> (1993)	109
Andrew Byrnes, "The 'Other' Human Rights Treaty Body: The Work of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women"	110
The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women, General Recommendation 21 (1994)	117

Topic 10:
HUMAN RIGHTS AND TREATY OBLIGATIONS (IV)

The Interpretation of International Human Rights Treaty Obligations in the Context of Domestic Statutory Interpretation: The Case of the Refugee Convention

<u>Immigration Act</u> (Canada)	124
(Geneva) <u>Convention relating to the Status of Refugees</u> (1950) and <u>Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees</u> (1966)	126
<u>Canada (Attorney-General) v. Ward</u> (Supreme Court of Canada)	132

The Use of International Human Rights Obligations to Interpret the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms: The Case of Social and Economic Rights

<u>Slaight Communications Inc. v. Davidson</u> (Supreme Court of Canada)	151
Craig Scott and Patrick Macklem, "Constitutional Ropes of Sand or Justiciable Guarantees? Social Rights in a New South African Constitution"	157
Scott Leckie, "From Infancy to Adulthood -- UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights -- and the Right to Adequate Housing"	161
Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Concluding Observations on Canada (May 1993)	163

Committee on the Rights of the Child, Concluding Observations on Canada (June 1995)	167
Craig Scott, "Covenant Constitutionalism and the Canada Assistance Plan"	169
Letter from Philip Alston, Chairperson, Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to His Excellency Gerald Shannon, Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Canada to the United Nations Office in Geneva (4 May 1995)	177
Letter from Philip Alston, Chairperson, Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to His Excellency Gerald Shannon, Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Canada to the United Nations Office in Geneva (5 December 1996)	178
Letter from Philip Alston, Chairperson, Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to Bruce Porter, Charter Committee on Poverty Issues (5 December 1996)	179

Topic 11:
HUMAN RIGHTS AND TREATY OBLIGATIONS (V)

Rhetoric and Treaty Interpretation

Ilmar Tammelo, "The Law of Nations and the Rhetorical Tradition of Legal Reasoning"	180
--	-----

**Gender Equality in International Labour Law and the Competing Rhetorics of
Protection**

<u>Interpretation of the Convention of 1919 Concerning Employment of Women During the Night</u> , (Advisory Opinion, Permanent Court of International Justice)	196
Lammy Betten, "Protection of Women at Work: Equal Treatment" in <u>International Labour Law: Selected Issues</u>	211